

Fourth Annual JAT Contest for New and Aspiring Translators (Japanese to English)

Source Text

第3章「たばこ対策への介入事例とその効果」要約

第3章では、警告表示、反たばこ広告キャンペーン、価格と消費、禁煙指導・禁煙支援、健康教育、国際機関等の取り組みについて述べている。

現在、諸外国においては様々なかたちで喫煙が健康におよぼす影響についての教育や法律による規制がなされており、その効果についても様々な研究がなされている。警告表示を導入した直後はその内容を覚えているが、導入後1ヶ月を過ぎるとその割合は、低下するというオーストラリアの報告、警告表示の形式を変えなければ、内容だけを変えても効果がないという米国の報告などがある。また、近年、カナダやオーストラリアにおいてたばこ製品の警告表示については、写真などを利用した視覚に訴えかける方法などが行われるようになったほか、警告表示の面積や異なる複数のメッセージを順番に表示させることを義務付けるなど様々な方法が取られている。

一方、価格引き上げのたばこ消費に対する影響については、物価上昇率や収入の増加率を超えてたばこの価格が上昇するとたばこの消費が減少し、これは特に未成年者や収入の低い層のたばこ消費の抑制につながると報告されている。

また、喫煙者の喫煙習慣への介入方法として諸外国では禁煙指導が盛んに行われており、多くの研究や報告がなされている。医療従事者などによる禁煙指導が禁煙指導を行わない場合に比べて禁煙率を有意に増加させ、さらに、複数の指導者による禁煙指導を行った場合にはその指導効果が更に高まるとの報告がなされている。

わが国においても喫煙防止教育の取り組みが進められており、ただ単に喫煙の健康影響に関する知識を提供するだけでなく、青少年の喫煙開始に関わる社会的要因の存在に気づかせ、それらの影響に対処するために必要なスキルの形成に焦点を当てたプログラムなどが1990年代になって登場してきている。また、平成14年度から完全実施される新学習指導要領では喫煙防止教育を第6学年で指導することが明記されるようになった。

このように各国において、様々なかたちでのたばこ対策が行われてきたところであるが、多国籍企業の国境を越えた経済活動の広がりや対策に必要な資源の国家間の不均衡などを踏まえて、世界保健機関（WHO）は1996年の世界保健総会で「たばこ対策のための枠組条約」の策定準備が決議され、2003年の5月を目途に採択する準備が進められており、現在、政府間交渉が行われている。

<http://www.mhlw.go.jp/topics/tobacco/houkoku/kituen01.html>

Finalists

The following six entries (#33, #39, #52, #53, #62, and #64) have made it to the final round.

Entry 33

Chapter 3 Examples of anti-smoking measures and their effects (Summary)

Chapter 3 discusses warning labels, anti-smoking advertising campaigns, the relationship between price and consumption, support and guidance in quitting smoking, health education, and the anti-smoking measures being taken by international organizations.

Currently, countries throughout the world are educating people about the effects of smoking on health and using legislation to regulate smoking in a variety of ways, and research into the effectiveness of these methods is being conducted. For example, a report from Australia has found that immediately after warning labels are introduced people remember their contents, but that the percentage of people who still remember the contents after a month decreases, and a U.S. report claims that changing the contents of the labels without changing the style is ineffective. In Canada and Australia various methods have been used in recent years, such as displaying photographs on the warning labels of tobacco products for visual effect and requiring that labels containing different messages, of different shapes and sizes are displayed after one another.

Reports regarding the effect of prices increases on tobacco consumption claim that when price hikes for tobacco products exceed the rates of increase for other products and for wages, the result is a decrease in consumption; particularly among under-age smokers and people in low-income groups.

Numerous studies and reports are being conducted into the effects of the many intervention efforts being made into the habits of smokers in various countries in order to help people quit smoking. Provision of guidance by medical professionals has been discovered to result in significantly higher numbers of smokers quitting, compared to cases where medical professionals are not involved in providing guidance. Further, the effectiveness of the guidance is enhanced even further when conducted by several people.

In Japan too, educational measures to prevent people taking up smoking are being implemented. These efforts are not only focused on providing information about the effects of smoking on health. Since the 1990s they have also included programs that concentrate on noticing the social factors that trigger smoking in young people and providing the skills to deal with their effects. In addition, the new curriculum guidelines to be fully implemented from the 2002 school year clearly state that education to prevent people from starting smoking be conducted in the sixth year of elementary school.

As shown by the above examples, various anti-smoking measures are currently in use in countries throughout the world. However, in view of the inequity between countries regarding the resources necessary for such counter-measures and in order to expand economic activity beyond the borders of multinational corporations, the World Health Organization (WHO) resolved to prepare the "Framework Convention on Tobacco Control" at the 1996 World Health Conference and negotiations between governments are now underway with the aim of adopting the framework in May 2003.

Entry 39

Chapter 3 Intervention Strategies for Tobacco Control and the Effects Thereof

Abstract:

Chapter 3, in reference to tobacco control, discusses the administration of warning labels, advertising campaigns against tobacco smoking, pricing and consumption, assistance programs for quitting, health education, and the involvement of international organizations.

Currently, countries outside Japan are taking various initiatives to educate people about the health risks of tobacco smoking and to institute regulations for tobacco control. Studies are also being conducted to determine their effectiveness. A report from Australia shows awareness among people regarding the content of warning labels is highest directly following implementation but decreases after one month. Another report from the United States demonstrates that changing the text in warning label alone is ineffective and must be accompanied with a change in format. Canada and Australia have recently adopted a method to visually appeal to consumers by using graphic warning labels along with other approaches such as mandating the size and order in which multiple messages are phrased.

Another study shows the correlation between increases in price and its affect on consumption. Raising the price of tobacco products exceeding the rate of inflation and growth in average income leads to a decrease in tobacco consumption, particularly among minors and lower income groups.

As an intervention strategy to help quit smoking, other countries engage in assistance programs promoting non-smoking, along with research projects confirming their effectiveness. In comparison with no intervention, a report suggests that programs assisted by healthcare professionals help reduce the amount of smoking significantly and programs incorporating the support from multiple resources further increase their effectiveness.

In Japan, we are pursuing educational outreach to prevent smoking, not only by providing information

concerning the health risks of smoking, but by promoting awareness of social factors that contribute to the initial adoption of the smoking habit among young people. In the 1990's, we introduced programs focusing on developing skills to counteract the pressure from such social factors. The new curriculum guideline, which is to take effect in Heisei 14 (2002), requires education on smoking prevention for six grade students.

The above examples show intervention efforts across borders for tobacco control. However, issues of broadening international economic activities by multinational corporations and disparities among national administrative resources need to be addressed. Recognizing the need for multinational effort, the World Health Organization passed a resolution for initiating a Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) at the World Health Assembly in 1996. Currently, intergovernmental negotiations are in progress to prepare for prospective adoption of FCTC resolution in May of 2003.

Entry 52

Chapter 3 Outline: "Case Studies of Anti-Smoking Intervention Measures and their Effectiveness"

Chapter 3 discusses warning labels, anti-smoking advertising campaigns, the effect of cost on consumption, smoking cessation counseling and support, health education, and initiatives by international organizations and such.

Currently there are various approaches being taken in different countries with respect to legal regulations and education about the effects of smoking on health and there is a wide range of research being conducted into the effectiveness of these approaches. For example, Australia has reported that people remember the content of warning labels immediately after they are introduced, but the rate of retention drops one month after their introduction, and the US has reported that if the form of the warning label is not changed, changing the content alone is ineffective. Also, in recent years Canada and Australia have implemented measures such as the use of photographs on warning labels to increase their visual impact, and additionally have started requiring that tobacco companies make their warning labels a certain size or display multiple, different messages in sequence.

Meanwhile, it has been reported that when the price of cigarettes rises faster than the rates of inflation and income, cigarette consumption declines and this correlation is particularly strong for minors and low-wage earners.

Furthermore, smoking cessation counseling is being actively conducted in various countries as a means of intervening in the habits of smokers, and there is a large amount of research and reporting being done. According to healthcare providers and others, smoking cessation counseling results in a significant

increase in the non-smoking rate when compared to cases where it is not employed, and moreover it is reported that the effectiveness of this method increases further when the counseling is conducted by multiple counselors.

In Japan too, education initiatives for the prevention of smoking are progressing, and these initiatives do not merely provide information about the effects of smoking on health. Rather, programs which make young people aware of the existence of the social factors related to smoking initiation and which focus on helping them to form the skills necessary for dealing with those factors, started to make an appearance in the 1990s. Also, since the full implementation of the new educational guidelines in 2002, it is specifically required that smoking prevention education be given in grade 6.

Anti-smoking measures are currently being carried out in various forms in different countries as described above, but at the 1996 World Health Assembly the World Health Organization (WHO), reflecting the expanding cross-border economic activities of multinational companies and the inequality among countries of the necessary resources for anti-smoking measures, voted to begin preparations for the drawing up of the "Framework Convention on Tobacco Control". Preparations are progressing with a target adoption date of May 2003, and intergovernmental negotiations are currently underway.

Entry 53

Chapter 3- Examples and Effects of Strategies to Curb Smoking—summary

This chapter looks at health warnings, anti-smoking advertisement campaigns, the relationship between pricing and consumption, anti-smoking guidance and support, health education, and the anti-smoking efforts of international organizations.

Different countries have through various methods engaged in educating their populations on the health consequences of smoking, and have imposed various legal restrictions in regard to tobacco usage, the results of which have been the focus much study. For instance, one report from Australia, which looked at health warnings, found that the contents of those warnings are remembered immediately after they are first introduced but not so much one month later. Meanwhile, another report, this time from the US, suggests that changing the contents of health warnings has no effect if the format of those warnings stays the same. In Canada and Australia, warnings in form of photographs and other such visually impacting methods have been used in recent years. Another device has been to enforce a requirement that numerous warning messages of varying size be arranged on each packet.

There are also reports to suggest a linkage between the price of tobacco and its consumption—smoking goes down when the price of tobacco rises faster than the cost of living and people's incomes. This is

particularly the case for those underage and those on low incomes.

In many countries there are widespread moves towards antismoking advice that directly targets the habits of smokers. This too has spawned many studies and reports. It is found that the rate of smokers quitting the habit increases significantly when health professionals instruct the public to do so compared to when such guidance is absent. Furthermore, it is reported that such instructions are even more effective when coming from numerous sources.

Japan has also seen moves to combat smoking through education. In the 1990s, a program emerged which not only provided information concerning the health consequences of smoking, but was also attentive to the social factors underlying young people taking up smoking. A focus was then put on fostering the necessary skills to deal with those influences. Also, in the now fully implemented New Course of Learning issued by the Japanese Ministry of Education in 2002, there is an explicit directive for the provision of anti-smoking education to 6th grade elementary school children.

In this way, various strategies for tackling smoking have been employed by different countries. However, in reaction to the global economic reach of multi-national corporations and the imbalance between states in their ability to come up with the resources needed to mount anti-smoking campaigns, the World Health Organization (WHO), at the 1996 World Health Assembly, made a decision to formulate an International Framework Convention for Tobacco Control. The prospects for its adoption by May, 2003 are well under way, with ongoing negotiations between governments.

Entry 62

Chapter 3: Examples of Intervention in Tobacco Control and their Effectiveness – Abstract

In Chapter Three, we discuss warning labels, anti-tobacco advertising campaigns, price and consumption, smoking cessation counseling and support, health education, and the efforts of international and other organizations.

Currently, education on the health effects of smoking and tobacco control via legislation are being carried out in a variety of forms abroad, and a variety of research into the results of those efforts is also underway. For example, a report from Australia shows that the content of warning labels could be recalled in the period immediately following their implementation, however, one month after implementation the recollection rate declined. Another report from the United States shows that unless the format of warning labels changes, it is ineffective to change only the content of the warnings. Moreover, in Australia and Canada various approaches have been taken towards warning labels on tobacco products in recent years: in addition to employing visually evocative methods such as using photographs or other images on

warning labels, requirements have also been set regarding the amount of surface area to be covered by the labels, as well as requiring that different warning messages are shown on a rotational basis.

Additionally, with regard to the effect of tobacco price hikes on tobacco consumption, reports indicate that tobacco consumption declines when the rise of the price of tobacco exceeds the rate of inflation as well as the income increase rate. This decline is especially connected to inhibiting tobacco consumption among minors and people in lower income brackets, according to reports.

Cessation counseling for smokers is also a thriving method of smoking intervention in foreign countries. A great deal of research is being done on this topic, and a number of reports have been released. One report shows that the rate of smoking cessation dramatically increases when the cessation counseling is done by healthcare professionals as compared to when a health professional is not present; when multiple practitioners are involved counseling produces even higher results.

Health education to prevent smoking has been making progress in Japan as well. These efforts are not limited to merely providing knowledge on the health effects of smoking; efforts are also being made to raise awareness among minors of the existence of societal factors related to taking up smoking at a young age. Programs focused on fostering the essential skills to cope with the influence of these societal factors have been available since the 1990s. In addition, it is clearly specified that education to prevent smoking must be provided in the sixth year of schooling, according to the new Courses of Study that will be implemented as the standards for educational courses in all elementary and secondary schools in 2002.

As such, tobacco control activities are currently taking place in many different forms in each country, however, in light of factors such as the international spread of the economic activities of multinational corporations, as well as the disparity among nations in the resources required for tobacco control activities, the World Health Organization (WHO) voted to develop a Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) at the 1996 World Health Assembly. Preparations are underway with the goal of adoption of the WHO FCTC in May 2003, and intergovernmental negotiations are currently in progress.

Entry 64

Section 3. Examples of Tobacco Control Interventions and their Effects (Summary)

Section 3 discusses warning labels, anti-smoking ad campaigns, prices and consumption, smoking cessation guidance and support, health education, and initiatives by international organizations.

Outside of Japan, tobacco control is being carried out in various forms through the use of laws and education about smoking's effects on health, and various studies are being conducted on their

effectiveness. According to an Australian report, consumers could recall the contents of a warning label immediately after its introduction, but one month after the introduction that percentage dropped. If the appearance of a warning label remains unchanged, changing the contents will have no effect, according to an American report. Also, in recent years, in addition to attracting the eyes through the use of pictures, an obligation to use certain label sizes and cycle through differing messages are among techniques used in warning labels on tobacco products in Canada and Australia.

Meanwhile, reports show that regarding the effect of raising prices on tobacco consumption, when the rise of tobacco prices exceeds the growth of income and the inflation rate, tobacco consumption decreases. This is particularly relevant to the control of tobacco consumption among minors and the low income class.

Also, smoking cessation guidance is actively being practiced outside of Japan through the use of intervention against the smoking habits of smokers, and much research is being done on the subject. According to reports, when smoking cessation guidance is given by a health care provider, smoking cessation rates are significantly higher than when guidance is not given, and furthermore, when the smoking cessation guidance is given by more than one guide, there is a further increase in guidance effectiveness.

In Japan as well, the anti-smoking education initiative continues to progress, and rather than simply providing information about the health effects of smoking, programs that introduce social factors related to starting smoking at an early age and focus on developing the skills necessary to deal with those influences started appearing in the 1990's. Also, the new course of study fully implemented since the 2002 fiscal year stipulate that anti-smoking education be taught in the 6th grade.

In this way, various forms of tobacco control have come to be carried out in many countries. In consideration of the spread of multinational corporations' cross-border economic activity and the imbalance between countries of resources necessary to address tobacco control, the World Health Organization (WHO) decided to request the initiation of the development the Framework Convention of Tobacco Control at the 1996 World Health Assembly. The preparation for its prospective adoption in May of 2003 continues and governmental talks are currently being held.

Results

The judges of the 4th annual JAT translation contest for new and aspiring translators have made their final decision, and the results are as follows:

The semi-finalists, in order of the numbers assigned to their entries, were:

- 33. Sarah Bull
- 39. Midori Nieft
- 51. Suzy Bates
- 52. Rossa O'Muireartaigh
- 62. Monica Farrell
- 64. Nathan Yeldell

After much deliberation, the judges awarded prizes as follows:

First place: No. 62, Monica Farrell

Second place: No. 33, Sarah Bull

Many thanks to everyone who applied. Choosing the winners was a difficult task, given the number of entries and their level. I observed the judges' deliberations via e-mail, and they they took their responsibilities very seriously. Even if you didn't win, I hope you found the contest to be a challenging and worthwhile exercise, and I hope that some of you will try again next year.

Karen Sandness
Contest Liaison

Commentaries from the Judges

Malcolm James

The stated purpose of the contest is "to cultivate new talent in commercial non-literary translation." In judging, I was trying to find the person with the most talent to become a top commercial translator, not the person who produced the best translation at this stage. Simple misinterpretations are likely to disappear with experience, so I regard them as less of a problem than if this were an actual commercial translation. I'm much less willing, however, to be lenient on translators who submit a translation that

doesn't seem to have got a final read-through, or who produce a translation that doesn't seem to have considered the document's context and purpose.

The passage for translation is part of a page giving plain language summaries of chapters of a government report. The Japanese is easy to read, well-structured, and quite accessible. I'd like to think the English could be, too. However, there are some paragraph-length sentences gave the translators problems.

General points

Three of the finalists wrote their translations from a different time perspective from the genko, which was dated December 2001. Two of the finalists translated "要約" in the title as "abstract," but that's not really appropriate for a chapter summary. Both of those errors could have been avoided by simply taking the URL at the top of the passage, looking at the full page on the Internet, and thinking more about the context of the part being translated. The "効果" in the title was also problematic. Four of the finalists used "effects," but two used "effectiveness," which seems a better fit with the rest of the passage. It's always a good idea to go back and do a reality check on the title when you reach the end of a passage.

Specific points for #33

I liked No. 33's translation for its clear writing, which makes it easy to understand. Examples include "the new curriculum guidelines to be fully implemented from the 2002 school year," and the treatment of Paragraph 3 (see comments on No. 62). However, there are places where this goes too far, sacrificing accuracy for readability. For example, "immediately after warning labels are introduced people remember their contents, but ... the percentage of people who still remember the contents after a month decreases" reads well, but the "still" shifts the emphasis and increases the risk of misinterpreting this phrase to refer to recollection after an interval of one month instead of recollection after a month of continual exposure. Contrast this with "consumers could recall the contents of a warning label immediately after its introduction, but one month after the introduction that percentage dropped." (No.64) There are also comprehension errors, as seen in "noticing the social factors that trigger smoking" and "in order to expand economic activity beyond the borders of multinational corporations."

No. 33's natural writing style is an excellent basis for translation, and I expect him/her to become a very good translator as experience brings greater comprehension of the Japanese.

Specific points for #39

No.39 was generally good, and read well, but suffered from grammar and logic problems in the English. Look at Paragraph 3: "Another study shows the correlation between increases in price and its affect on

consumption. Raising the price of tobacco products exceeding the rate of inflation and growth in average income leads to a decrease in tobacco consumption, particularly among minors and lower income groups." The translation is correct, but it has the following problems:

- Word choice: "affect" should be "effect". (Interestingly, No.39 used "effect" correctly in the title.)
- Logic: There's always a correlation between an action and its effect, so perhaps this should have been "correlation between price and consumption"?
- Word choice: "Raising the price ... exceeding the rate of inflation" should be "... in excess of the rate of inflation"

On the other hand, there were some places where the phrasing was inspired, reading naturally, but still conveying the full meaning of the Japanese. "Programs focusing on developing skills to counteract the pressure from such social factors" is a good example. Also, No. 39 was the only finalist to actively acknowledge the way the last paragraph uses "各国" to signal a contrast between what's happening at the national level and what's happening at the international level.

Specific points for #52

I took an instant liking to No. 52 for being the only finalist to find a proper place for "cigarettes" in a text where the focus was on "tobacco."

However, there were a number of translation errors (for example, "According to healthcare providers and others, smoking cessation counseling" for "医療従事者などによる禁煙指導") and over-literal translations ("research and reporting being done").

I liked the phrasing of "this correlation is particularly strong for minors and low-wage earners," and the brevity of No. 52's treatment of Paragraph 3 (see comments on No. 62).

Specific points for #53

Although No.53 appeared to misunderstand the passage at several points, he/she had a nice turn of phrase, as seen in "Another device" in Paragraph 2. The translation was let down by poor checking, though. A proper read-through before submission would have caught the following errors in the English:

Para 2: "have been the focus much study" (should be "...focus of much ...")

Para 2: "warnings in form of photographs" (should be "... in the form of ...")

Para 4: "advice that direct targets the habits" ("... directly targets ..."?)

Para 6: "The prospects ... are well under way" (?)

Specific points for #62:

The overall winner, but tended to be wordy, which sometimes made the text a little less comprehensible. For example, compare three different versions of Paragraph 3:

No.62: Additionally, with regard to the effect of tobacco price hikes on tobacco consumption, reports indicate that tobacco consumption declines when the rise of the price of tobacco exceeds the rate of inflation as well as the income increase rate. This decline is especially connected to inhibiting tobacco consumption among minors and people in lower income brackets, according to reports.

No.33: Reports regarding the effect of prices increases on tobacco consumption claim that when price hikes for tobacco products exceed the rates of increase for other products and for wages, the result is a decrease in consumption; particularly among under-age smokers and people in low-income groups.

No.52: Meanwhile, it has been reported that when the price of cigarettes rises faster than the rates of inflation and income, cigarette consumption declines and this correlation is particularly strong for minors and low-wage earners.

For this paragraph, No.62 takes 30% more words than No.33 and 73% more words than No.52 to say pretty much the same thing. These translations are all 'correct' but take different approaches. No.62 would benefit from practice at editing his or her own translations to cut the number of words by 15% or so without sacrificing accuracy.

Errors included the logical error in "unless the format of warning labels changes, it is ineffective to change only the content of the warnings" ("only" introduces a contradiction), "the new Courses of Study that will be implemented as the standards for educational courses ..." ("standard"?), and there were over-literal translations such as "This decline is especially connected to inhibiting tobacco consumption" and "negotiations are currently in progress" ("currently" is superfluous).

I particularly liked the overall accuracy of this translation, and expect the translator to keep improving as experience brings more confidence to step away from a very literal approach.

Specific points for #64:

Had some nice ideas but poor execution. I liked the attempt to write the text in a readable manner, but there were too many places where the English would have benefited from a critical read-through before submission. Examples include:

Subject-verb agreement: Para 2: "an obligation ... are among techniques" (should be "obligations" or "is among techniques")

Subject-verb agreement: Para 5: "the new course of study ... stipulate ..." (should be "should be stipulates" or "stipulated")

Word choice: Para 5: "stipulate that ... education be taught" (a lofty ambition, but inappropriate here)

Unnatural phrasing: Para 7: the ... WHO ... decided to request the initiation of the development the Framework ... (it's the string of nested structures that's unnatural, but I also marked this down for missing an "of" before "the Framework" and for mistranslating what was decided)

This translator would do well to practice reading with a critical perspective. Either persuade an experienced editor to give feedback, or, as one of the EJ division judges suggested, get someone else to read the translation out loud.

Ken Wagner

In 1954, two British physicians published findings suggesting a causal link between smoking and untimely death. Twelve years later, in 1966, the US Surgeon General required the first warning labels on cigarettes in the United States. Earlier this month, the World Health Organization announced that tobacco use could kill one billion people in the 21st century, up from a scant million in the 20th century. Once viewed as glamorous and even healthy (with claims of relieving stress and promoting good digestion, for example), smoking has been vilified by the medical community as a major health hazard for decades. This has given birth to a well established medical discipline of smoking cessation treatment and a public health campaign against tobacco use waged on national and international fronts. This in turn has spawned its own body of writing with its own unique jargon, an example of which was the passage for the Japanese-English portion of this year's contest (namely, 「たばこ対策への介入事例とその効果」要約) .

The purpose of the JAT Translation Contest is "to foster, recognize, and reward excellence in commercial, non-literary translation between Japanese and English by new translators." One method of assessing technical translation, proposed by the American Translators Association, breaks the translation process into three areas: source language comprehension, target language writing, and "translation technique." (I simply cite the ATA's approach because I am familiar with it.) The last, translation technique, includes proofreading to ensure the translator has avoided mistakes and research to ensure that the vocabulary and usage are appropriate and, especially in the case of Japanese, to help the translator interpret any vague passages.

The たばこ対策 passage used technical vocabulary sparingly (it had almost a general sound), but did contain some of the key vocabulary of the anti-smoking field. This included the terms smoking cessation, cessation counseling, warning labels, tobacco consumption, rotation (of warning labels), and the proper names of an organization and a publication. In fact, the publication (an agreement, actually), the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control, adopted at a WHO World Health Assembly, was one piece of research material that yielded, in addition to its own proper name, the vocabulary and feel of anti-smoking public health writing. A little more Googling with the vocabulary available in the Framework Convention provides all of the information needed to set the right tone and employ the right vocabulary

for the translation.

Monica Farrell (Entry 62) employed all of the field-specific vocabulary cited above, a low number of source comprehension errors, and workmanlike writing to win this year's contest. Each of the six semi-finalists selected had his or her own strength, and some produced very likable English prose. However, Monica showed the willingness to do the amount of research that I would think would lead to consistently accurate and appropriate translations and serve as a basis for continued growth as a translator.

Sarah Bull (Entry 33) produced perhaps the most readable translation. However, the number of comprehension errors was comparable to that of Monica's and Sarah took a more neutral approach, not employing some of the key terms of the smoking cessation field.

I, for one, could not see an immediately apparent winner among the six semi-finalists provided to the judges by the JAT screeners. Several readings and careful analysis of the texts were necessary to produce the finalists and the winner. Each contestant showed different strengths, and the judges found it difficult to select a winner. Considerable negotiation was necessary, with each judge presenting arguments for his selection. That serves as evidence of the competitive quality of all of the semifinalists' translations.

Steven Venti

Good translation is a little bit like pornography: very hard to define but easy to recognize when you see it. This is especially true for commercial translation, which unlike literary translation, is almost always compared side-by-side with the original in evaluating "translation accuracy." Personally, I think that "translation accuracy" is an ill-conceived and poorly defined concept. For example, how does one quantify translation accuracy? Advertisements for translation software often cite translation accuracy as a percentage, but what does it mean to be "90% accurate" versus "80% accuracy," and just where is the borderline between "usable" and "unusable" or "acceptable" and "unacceptable?"

While it probably isn't possible either to fashion an axiomatic definition of or to establish quantitative standards for evaluating translation accuracy, it certainly is possible to list a few of the characteristics that are essential to a professional quality translation.

Perhaps the first thing that need be mentioned is that the translation should contain all the same factual information that the original does. Certainly no translation could be considered accurate or complete if an important piece of information was missing. There are times, however, when certain information explicit in the original need not appear in the translation if the conventions of the target language preclude its inclusion. An example very commonly found in Japanese to English translation might be the inclusion in parenthesis of the acronym for the name of an organization even though the acronym is not used

anywhere else in the document. This occurs in this year's contest text where the World Health Organization is mentioned in the final paragraph. Is there any real need to include WHO in parenthesis there?

The opposite can also be true in cases where information implicit in the original need be explained to the target readers. This year's text, for example, mentioned a *dairoku gakunen*, which could be translated as "sixth year of schooling," but given the diversity of nomenclature in the various school systems found in English speaking countries, I heartily concur with those who rendered this as "6th year of elementary school."

Clearly, one of the first skills that a successful translator must develop is the ability to recognize what should or shouldn't be translated.

Another characteristic to consider is whether the translation conveys the necessary information in the same tenor and tone as the original and as appropriate for the target reader. A good example of this from this year's contest was the word *youyaku* in the title. Even professional translators will disagree over whether to include a word such as summary or abstract in the title itself, or perhaps to leave it out of the title altogether, and simply make clear in the topic sentence of the opening paragraph that what is being given here is a description of the content rather than a reproduction of the chapter itself.

In fact, one of the most difficult aspects of judging a translation contest is the fact that there is rarely only one "correct" translation. Rather, there are usually a number of possible approaches, and the question of whether a given approach is appropriate for a given problem is one that can only be answered in the context of what the translation is for, who the target reader is, and how much time can be allotted to translating the problematic passage.

One last issue I would like to comment on is the question of how literal a commercial translation should be. Translators who specialize in patents or legal documents, both of which are often subject to word-by-word scrutiny, understand the expediency of producing a commercial translation with a one-to-one correspondence to the original. Such an approach might not produce the most readable translation, but is an effective way to assuage a client's fears that something is either missing or mistranslated, and in many cases makes it easier for the end-user to use both the original and the translation side-by-side.

This level of linguistic correspondence is in sharp contrast to the more figurative approach taken in commercial translations for publication, especially in documents where the use of idioms as well as hyperbole, parallelism, and other rhetorical techniques make word-by-word translation inappropriate. At this level, evaluating translation accuracy can be far more complicated, sometimes bordering on the

subjective.

It may seem strange that "accuracy" can be considered to be something less than completely objective, but when editing for readability or when evaluating word choices, composition, and other stylistic considerations, the question of whether a translation accurately reflects the tenor and tone of the original is one on which even experienced translators can occasionally disagree.

There was much to praise in all of the final entries in this year's contest, and one problem with a contest is that the need to pick a winner leads to excessive nit-picking of otherwise competent work. All of the finalists showed talent and are to be congratulated for their efforts.

-END-